# Twisted Whitney towers and higher-order Arf invariants

Rob Schneiderman & Peter Teichner, (with J. Conant)

Lehman College CUNY & MPIM (and AGS Labs)

Fall 2022

Recall that the following are equivalent:

- $L = \bigcup_{i=1}^{m} L_i \subset S^3$  is link-homotopically trivial.
- Non-repeating Milnor invariants  $\mu_k(L)$  vanish for  $k \leq m-2$ .
- L bounds an order m-1 non-repeating Whitney tower  $\mathcal{W} \subset B^4$ .
- Intersection invariants  $\lambda_k(\mathcal{W}) = 0 \in \Lambda_k$  for  $k \leq m 2$ .
- *L* lifts to the *m*th level of the Goodwillie–Weiss link map tower.

Invariants here are torsion-free, and ignore twisted Whitney disks.

Recall that the following are equivalent:

- $L = \bigcup_{i=1}^{m} L_i \subset S^3$  is link-homotopically trivial.
- Non-repeating Milnor invariants  $\mu_k(L)$  vanish for  $k \leq m-2$ .
- L bounds an order m-1 non-repeating Whitney tower  $\mathcal{W} \subset B^4$ .
- Intersection invariants  $\lambda_k(\mathcal{W}) = 0 \in \Lambda_k$  for  $k \leq m 2$ .
- *L* lifts to the *m*th level of the Goodwillie–Weiss link map tower.

Invariants here are torsion-free, and ignore twisted Whitney disks.

- Will generalize the above to give a classification of links bounding order *n* twisted Whitney towers in terms of Milnor invariants with repeated indices allowed (still torsion-free) and higher-order Arf invariants (2-torsion related to Whitney disk twistings).

Recall that the following are equivalent:

- $L = \bigcup_{i=1}^{m} L_i \subset S^3$  is link-homotopically trivial.
- Non-repeating Milnor invariants  $\mu_k(L)$  vanish for  $k \leq m-2$ .
- L bounds an order m-1 non-repeating Whitney tower  $\mathcal{W} \subset B^4$ .
- Intersection invariants  $\lambda_k(\mathcal{W}) = 0 \in \Lambda_k$  for  $k \leq m 2$ .
- *L* lifts to the *m*th level of the Goodwillie–Weiss link map tower.

Invariants here are torsion-free, and ignore twisted Whitney disks.

Will generalize the above to give a classification of links bounding
order *n* twisted Whitney towers in terms of Milnor invariants
with repeated indices allowed (still torsion-free) and higher-order
Arf invariants (2-torsion related to Whitney disk twistings).

- We hope to find a corresponding relationship with the Goodwillie–Weiss concordance tower.

- Twisted Whitney towers and their trees
- Intersection invariants for order *n* twisted Whitney towers
- Classification of order n twisted Whitney towers in  $B^4$
- The Higher-order Arf invariant Conjecture

Eliminates  $p, q \in A \pitchfork B$  without creating new intersections in A or B:



W is *clean* = embedded & interior disjoint from all surfaces. W is *framed* = W has appropriate parallels.

# $r \in W \pitchfork C \quad \rightsquigarrow \quad r', r'' \in A \pitchfork C$ after *W*-move on *A*:



Whitney move uses two parallel copies of W:



#### Framed Whitney disks and twisted Whitney disks

The *twisting*  $\omega(W) \in \mathbb{Z}$  of W is the relative Euler number of a normal section  $\overline{\partial W}$  over  $\partial W$  determined by the sheets:



If  $\omega(W) = 0$ , then W is framed. If  $\omega(W) \neq 0$ , then W is twisted. The *twisting*  $\omega(W) \in \mathbb{Z}$  of W is the relative Euler number of a normal section  $\overline{\partial W}$  over  $\partial W$  determined by the sheets:



If  $\omega(W) = 0$ , then W is framed. If  $\omega(W) \neq 0$ , then W is twisted.



Close up of normal section  $\overline{\partial W}$  in  $\partial W \times D^2$ :



A *Whitney tower* on  $A^2 \hookrightarrow X^4$  is defined by:

- 1. A itself is a Whitney tower.
- 2. If  $\mathcal{W}$  is a Whitney tower and W is a Whitney disk pairing intersections in  $\mathcal{W}$ , then the union  $\mathcal{W} \cup W$  is a Whitney tower.

A *Whitney tower* on  $A^2 \hookrightarrow X^4$  is defined by:

- 1. A itself is a Whitney tower.
- 2. If  $\mathcal{W}$  is a Whitney tower and W is a Whitney disk pairing intersections in  $\mathcal{W}$ , then the union  $\mathcal{W} \cup W$  is a Whitney tower.



Part of a Whitney tower

The *intersection forest* multiset t(W) of a Whitney tower W



'framed tree'  $t_p \leftarrow p$  unpaired intersection with sign  $\epsilon_p = \pm 1$ , 'twisted tree'  $J^{\infty} := J \longrightarrow \omega \leftarrow W_J$  with twisting  $\omega(W_J) \neq 0 \in \mathbb{Z}$ .  $W_{(i,j)}$  pairing  $A_i \pitchfork A_j \longrightarrow$  rooted tree  $-\!\!<^j_i = (i,j)$ 



Recursively:  $W_{(I,J)}$  pairing  $W_I \pitchfork W_J \longrightarrow - \langle I = (I,J)$ 



Rooted trees I, J = non-associative bracketings from  $\{1, 2, 3, ..., m\}$ Notation convention: Singleton subscript  $W_i$  denotes component  $A_i$ .

#### <u>Un</u>-paired intersections $\rightarrow$ <u>un</u>-rooted trees

Inner product 'fuses' rooted edges into single edge:

$$p \in W_{(I,J)} \pitchfork W_k \quad \longmapsto \quad t_p = \langle (I,J), K \rangle = \ \frac{I}{J} > -\kappa$$



∞-trees ('twisted' trees) for twisted Whitney disks

$$W_J \quad \mapsto \quad J^{\infty} := J - \infty \quad \text{if } \omega(W_J) \neq 0.$$



**Example:** Figure-8 knot bounds  $\mathcal{W}$  with  $t(\mathcal{W}) = (1,1)^{\infty} = \frac{1}{1} > --\infty$ 



The Whitney disk  $W_{(1,1)}$  is <u>clean</u> (since right picture is an unlink).

**Example:** Figure-8 knot bounds  $\mathcal{W}$  with  $t(\mathcal{W}) = (1,1)^{\infty} = \frac{1}{1} > --\infty$ 



The Whitney disk  $W_{(1,1)}$  is <u>twisted</u> (since blue and purple link once).

Obstruction theory for links bounding twisted Whitney towers

 W is an order n twisted Whitney tower if t(W) contains only framed trees of order ≥ n and twisted trees of order ≥ n/2, where <u>order</u> := number of trivalent vertices.

- W is an order n twisted Whitney tower if t(W) contains only framed trees of order ≥ n and twisted trees of order ≥ n/2, where <u>order</u> := number of trivalent vertices.
- Will define abelian groups  $\mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$ and intersection invariants  $\tau_n^{\infty}(\mathcal{W}) := [t(\mathcal{W})] \in \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$ such that:

*L* bounds an order *n* twisted  $\mathcal{W}$  with  $\tau_n^{\infty}(\mathcal{W}) = 0$  if and only if *L* bounds an order n + 1 twisted Whitney tower.

- W is an order n twisted Whitney tower if t(W) contains only framed trees of order ≥ n and twisted trees of order ≥ n/2, where <u>order</u> := number of trivalent vertices.
- Will define abelian groups  $\mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$ and intersection invariants  $\tau_n^{\infty}(\mathcal{W}) := [t(\mathcal{W})] \in \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$ such that:

*L* bounds an order *n* twisted W with  $\tau_n^{\infty}(W) = 0$  if and only if *L* bounds an order n + 1 twisted Whitney tower.

•  $\tau_n^{\infty}(L) := \tau_n^{\infty}(\mathcal{W}) \leftrightarrow \text{Milnor and higher-order Arf invariants}$ 

Towards intersection invariants  $\tau_n^{\infty}(W) = [t(W)] \in \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$ for order *n* twisted Whitney towers  $W \subset B^4$  bounded by  $L \subset S^3$  Towards intersection invariants  $\tau_n^{\infty}(W) = [t(W)] \in \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$ for order *n* twisted Whitney towers  $W \subset B^4$  bounded by  $L \subset S^3$ 

 $\mathcal{T}_n :=$  free abelian group on order *n* framed trees modulo local *antisymmetry* (AS) and *Jacobi* (IHX) relations:

$$+$$
  $=$   $0$   $=$   $+$   $\times$ 

AS relations  $\Rightarrow$  signs of the framed trees in  $t(\mathcal{W})$  only depend on the orientation of  $L = \bigcup_i \partial D^2 \subset \bigcup_i D^2 \stackrel{A_i}{\hookrightarrow} B^4$  after mapping to  $\mathcal{T}_n$ .

IHX trees can be created locally by controlled manipulations of Whitney disks.

Obstructions to raising twisted order from 2j - 1 to 2j:

Obstructions to raising twisted order from 2j - 1 to 2j:

## **Definition:**

 $\mathcal{T}_{2j-1}^{\infty}$  is the quotient of  $\mathcal{T}_{2j-1}$  by *boundary-twist relations:* 

$$i - J_{J} = 0$$

where J ranges over all order j - 1 subtrees.

Since via boundary-twisting (see next frame):

$$i \longrightarrow J \mapsto i \longrightarrow i \longrightarrow j \mapsto - 2j$$

and the trees on the right are allowed in order 2j twisted  $\mathcal{W}$ .

*Boundary twist* on W changes  $\omega(W)$  by  $\pm 1$ , creates intersection p between W and a sheet paired by W



*Boundary twist* on W changes  $\omega(W)$  by  $\pm 1$ , creates intersection p between W and a sheet paired by W



Can create any clean  $W_{(I,J)}$  by finger moves, then boundary twist into *J*-sheet changes t(W) by:

 $I \longrightarrow J \pm I \longrightarrow {}_{\omega}^{J}$ 

Obstructions to raising twisted order from 2j to 2j + 1:

Obstructions to raising twisted order from 2j to 2j + 1:

# **Definition:**

 $\mathcal{T}_{2j}^{\infty}$  is the quotient of the free abelian group on framed trees of order 2j and  $\infty$ -trees of order jby the following relations:

- 1. AS and IHX relations on order 2j framed trees
- 2. symmetry relations:  $(-J)^{\infty} = J^{\infty}$
- 3. *twisted IHX* relations:  $I^{\infty} = H^{\infty} + X^{\infty} \langle H, X \rangle$
- 4. <u>interior-twist</u> relations:  $2 \cdot J^{\infty} = \langle J, J \rangle$

Next frame shows how to realize interior-twist relation. (See notes for realization of twisted IHX relation.) After the interior twist,

near an arc in W that runs between the two sheets:

![](_page_34_Figure_3.jpeg)

Can create any clean  $W_J$  by finger moves, then  $\pm$ -interior twist changes t(W) by:

$$\pm \langle J, J \rangle \quad \mp \quad 2 \cdot J^{\circ}$$

For an order n twisted Whitney tower  $\mathcal{W}$  define

$$\tau_n^{\infty}(\mathcal{W}) := [t(\mathcal{W})] \in \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$$

For an order n twisted Whitney tower  $\mathcal W$  define

$$\tau_n^{\infty}(\mathcal{W}) := [t(\mathcal{W})] \in \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$$

## Theorem:

 $L \subset S^3$  bounds an order n twisted  $\mathcal{W} \subset B^4$  with  $\tau_n^{\infty}(\mathcal{W}) = 0 \in \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$  if and only if L bounds an order n + 1 twisted Whitney tower.

For an order n twisted Whitney tower  $\mathcal{W}$  define

$$\tau_n^{\infty}(\mathcal{W}) := [t(\mathcal{W})] \in \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$$

## Theorem:

 $L \subset S^3$  bounds an order n twisted  $\mathcal{W} \subset B^4$  with  $\tau_n^{\infty}(\mathcal{W}) = 0 \in \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$  if and only if L bounds an order n + 1 twisted Whitney tower.

Idea of proof: Realize relations by geometric constructions to turn 'algebraic cancellation' in  $\mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$  into 'geometric cancellation' by new layer of Whitney disks.

For 
$$L = L_1 \cup L_2 \cup \cdots \cup L_m \subset S^3$$
 and  $G = \pi_1(S^3 \setminus L)$ :

 $[L_i] \in G_{n+1}$  (n+1)th lower central subroup  $\implies \frac{G_{n+1}}{G_{n+2}} \cong \mathcal{L}_{n+1}$ 

 $\mathcal{L} = \bigoplus_n \mathcal{L}_n$  the free  $\mathbb{Z}$ -Lie algebra on  $\{X_1, X_2, \dots, X_m\}$ .

For 
$$L = L_1 \cup L_2 \cup \cdots \cup L_m \subset S^3$$
 and  $G = \pi_1(S^3 \setminus L)$ :

 $[L_i] \in G_{n+1}$  (n+1)th lower central subroup  $\implies \frac{G_{n+1}}{G_{n+2}} \cong \mathcal{L}_{n+1}$ 

 $\mathcal{L} = \bigoplus_n \mathcal{L}_n$  the free  $\mathbb{Z}$ -Lie algebra on  $\{X_1, X_2, \dots, X_m\}$ .

Define the order *n* Milnor invariant  $\mu_n(L)$ :

$$\mu_n(L) := \sum_{i=1}^m X_i \otimes \ell_i \in \mathcal{L}_1 \otimes \mathcal{L}_{n+1}$$

where  $\ell_i$  is the image in  $\mathcal{L}_{n+1}$  of the *i*-th longitude  $[L_i] \in \frac{G_{n+1}}{G_{n+2}}$ .

For 
$$L = L_1 \cup L_2 \cup \cdots \cup L_m \subset S^3$$
 and  $G = \pi_1(S^3 \setminus L)$ :

$$[L_i] \in G_{n+1} \ (n+1)$$
th lower central subroup  $\implies rac{G_{n+1}}{G_{n+2}} \cong \mathcal{L}_{n+1}$ 

 $\mathcal{L} = \bigoplus_n \mathcal{L}_n$  the free  $\mathbb{Z}$ -Lie algebra on  $\{X_1, X_2, \ldots, X_m\}$ .

Define the order *n* Milnor invariant  $\mu_n(L)$ :

$$\mu_n(L) := \sum_{i=1}^m X_i \otimes \ell_i \in \mathcal{L}_1 \otimes \mathcal{L}_{n+1}$$

where  $\ell_i$  is the image in  $\mathcal{L}_{n+1}$  of the *i*-th longitude  $[L_i] \in \frac{G_{n+1}}{G_{n+2}}$ .

Turns out:  $\mu_n(L) \in \mathcal{D}_n := \ker \{ \mathcal{L}_1 \otimes \mathcal{L}_{n+1} \xrightarrow{\text{bracket}} \mathcal{L}_{n+2} \}.$ 

The map  $\eta_n:\mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}\to\mathcal{L}_1\otimes\mathcal{L}_{n+1}$  is defined on generators by

$$\eta_n(t) := \sum_{v \in t} X_{\mathsf{label}(v)} \otimes \mathsf{Bracket}_v(t) \qquad \eta_n(J^{\infty}) := \frac{1}{2} \eta_n(\langle J, J \rangle)$$

Here J is a rooted tree of order j for n = 2j.

$$\begin{array}{rcl} \eta_1 \big( 1 -\!\!<\! \frac{3}{2} \big) &=& X_1 \otimes -\!\!<\! \frac{3}{2} &+& X_2 \otimes 1 -\!\!<\! ^3 &+& X_3 \otimes 1 -\!\!<\! _2 \\ &=& X_1 \otimes [X_2, X_3] + X_2 \otimes [X_3, X_1] + X_3 \otimes [X_1, X_2]. \end{array}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \eta_2(& \sim -<\frac{2}{1}) &= \frac{1}{2} \eta_2(\frac{1}{2} > <\frac{2}{1}) \\ &= X_1 \otimes _2 > <\frac{2}{1} + X_2 \otimes ^1 > <\frac{2}{1} \\ &= X_1 \otimes [X_2, [X_1, X_2]] + X_2 \otimes [[X_1, X_2], X_1]. \end{aligned}$$

The image of  $\eta_n$  is equal to the bracket kernel  $\mathcal{D}_n < \mathcal{L}_1 \otimes \mathcal{L}_{n+1}$ .

## **Theorem:**

If L bounds a twisted Whitney tower W of order n, then the order q Milnor invariants  $\mu_q(L)$  vanish for q < n, and

$$\mu_n(L) = \eta_n \circ \tau_n^{\infty}(\mathcal{W}) \in \mathcal{D}_n$$

Proof idea: Gropes in  $B^4 \setminus W$  display longitudes of L as iterated commutators exactly according to  $\eta_n \circ \tau_n^{\infty}(W)$ ...

$$W_n^{\infty} := \frac{\{\text{links in } S^3 \text{ bounding order } n \text{ twisted Whitney towers in } B^4\}}{\text{order } n+1 \text{ twisted Whitney tower concordance}}$$

Obstruction theory  $\implies W_n^{\infty}$  is a finitely generated abelian group

Via Cochran's Bing-doubling techniques get epimorphisms

$$R_n^{\infty}: \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty} \twoheadrightarrow W_n^{\infty}$$

which send  $g \in \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$  to the equivalence class of links bounding an order *n* twisted Whitney tower  $\mathcal{W}$  with  $\tau_n^{\infty}(\mathcal{W}) = g$ .

**Example of**  $R_n^{\infty}$  :  $\mathcal{T}_n^{\infty} \rightarrow W_n^{\infty}$  for n = 2

![](_page_45_Figure_1.jpeg)

L bounds 
$${\mathcal W}$$
 with  $au_2^\infty({\mathcal W})=rac{1}{2}>>><rac{1}{3}$ 

**Example of**  $R_n^{\infty} : \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty} \twoheadrightarrow W_n^{\infty}$  for n = 2

![](_page_46_Figure_1.jpeg)

L bounds 
$${\mathcal W}$$
 with  $au_2^\infty({\mathcal W})=rac{2}{1}>-\!\!-\infty$ 

Have commutative triangle diagram of epimorphisms:

![](_page_47_Figure_2.jpeg)

## Theorem:

The maps  $\eta_n : \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty} \to \mathcal{D}_n$  are isomorphisms for  $n \equiv 0, 1, 3 \mod 4$ .

# **Corollary:**

For  $n \equiv 0, 1, 3 \mod 4$ :

- $\mu_n \colon W_n^{\infty} \to \mathcal{D}_n$  and  $R_n^{\infty} \colon \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty} \to W_n^{\infty}$  are isomorphisms.
- $\tau_n^{\infty}(\mathcal{W}) \in \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$  only depends on  $L = \partial \mathcal{W}$ .

 $\mathcal{D}_n$  is a free abelian group of known rank for all n, so have a complete computation of  $W_n^{\infty} \cong \mathcal{D}_n \cong \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$  in three quarters of the cases.

Towards understanding the remaining cases  $n \equiv 2 \mod 4$ : **Proposition:** The map  $1 \otimes J \mapsto \infty \longrightarrow J \in \mathcal{T}_{4j-2}^{\infty}$  induces an isomorphism:

$$\mathbb{Z}_2 \otimes \mathcal{L}_j \cong \mathsf{Ker}(\eta_{4j-2} : \mathcal{T}^{\infty}_{4j-2} \to \mathcal{D}_{4j-2})$$

Extending the algebraic side of the triangle:

![](_page_49_Figure_2.jpeg)

$$R^{\infty}_{4j-2} \text{ induces } \alpha^{\infty}_{j} : \mathbb{Z}_{2} \otimes \mathcal{L}_{j} \twoheadrightarrow \mathsf{K}^{\infty}_{4j-2} := \ker\{\mu_{4j-2} : \mathsf{W}^{\infty}_{4j-2} \twoheadrightarrow \mathcal{D}_{4j-2}\}$$

![](_page_50_Figure_2.jpeg)

#### Higher-order Arf invariant diagram

Also extending the topological side of the triangle:

![](_page_51_Figure_2.jpeg)

$$\operatorname{Arf}_j := \mathsf{K}^{\infty}_{4j-2} \to (\mathbb{Z}_2 \otimes \mathsf{L}_j) / \operatorname{Ker} \alpha^{\infty}_j$$

## **Corollary:**

The groups  $W_n^{\infty}$  are classified by Milnor invariants  $\mu_n$  and, in addition, higher-order Arf invariants  $\operatorname{Arf}_j$  for n = 4j - 2.

In particular, a link bounds an order n+1 twisted W if and only if its Milnor invariants and higher-order Arf invariants vanish up to order n.

![](_page_53_Figure_1.jpeg)

#### Conjectured higher-order Arf invariant diagram

![](_page_54_Figure_1.jpeg)

**Conjecture:** (Higher-order Arf invariant conjecture)  $\operatorname{Arf}_j : \mathsf{K}^{\infty}_{4j-2} \to \mathbb{Z}_2 \otimes \mathsf{L}_j$  are isomorphisms for all *j*.

This conjecture would imply  $W_n^{\infty} \xrightarrow{\tau_n^{\infty}} \mathcal{T}_n^{\infty}$  is an isomorphism for all n.

- Arf<sub>1</sub> corresponds to classical Arf invariants of the link components. Are the Arf<sub>j</sub> for j > 1 also determined by finite type isotopy invariants?
- The links  $R_{4j-2}^{\infty}(\infty \langle J \rangle)$  realizing the image of  $\operatorname{Arf}_{j}$  are known not to be *slice* by work of J.C. Cha.
- Fundamental first open test case: Does the Bing double of the Figure-8 knot  $R_6^{\infty}(\infty <_{(1,2)}^{(1,2)}) \in W_6^{\infty}$  bound an order 7 twisted Whitney tower?
- If the Bing double of the Figure-8 knot does bound an order 7 twisted Whitney tower, then Arf<sub>i</sub> are trivial for all j ≥ 2.

**Bing(Fig8) bounds**  $\mathcal{W}$  with  $t(\mathcal{W}) = ((1,2), (1,2))^{\infty}$ 

 $W = D_1 \cup D_2 \cup W_{(1,2)} \cup W_{(1,2),(1,2))}$ 

![](_page_56_Figure_2.jpeg)

- There does not exist  $A:S^2\cup S^2 \hookrightarrow B^4$  supporting  $\mathcal W$  with

$$t(\mathcal{W}) = \mathfrak{O} \longrightarrow \overset{(1,2)}{\underset{(1,2)}{\leftarrow}}$$

(possibly + higher-order trees).

- The Bing double of any knot with non-trivial classical Arf invariant does not bound an order 6 *framed* Whitney tower.
- There does not exist  $A : S^2 \cup S^2 \hookrightarrow B^4$  supporting  $\mathcal{W}$  with  $t(\mathcal{W}) = \langle (((((((1,2),1),2),1),2),1)) + \langle ((((((((1,2),2),1),2),1),2)) \rangle$ (possibly + higher-order trees).

• Equivariant Milnor and Arf invariant correspondence with  $\pi_1$ -decorated tree-valued intersection invariants for order *n* Whitney towers bounded by links in non-simply-connected 3-manifolds?

• Use t(W) to efficiently formulate indeterminacies in Milnor invariants?

• Higher-order Arf invariants for 2-spheres supporting Whitney towers in 4-manifolds?

![](_page_59_Picture_0.jpeg)

![](_page_60_Picture_0.jpeg)

![](_page_60_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_61_Figure_0.jpeg)